

## Arguing the Merits of Nominations for Red Clover Award

Common Core ELA Standards: Writing 3, 4, 5, 9, 10; Language 1, 2, 3

Lead children in the development of a set of criteria for examining each of the books nominated for the Red Clover Award. Create one criteria chart for non-fiction texts and another for fictional texts. Model the process of rating a book (not one of the nominated selections) according to the appropriate criteria chart. Allow children to use the same process to evaluate the criteria for each book. In addition to the criteria charts, children may add personal notes to the comment section to help them make their final decision. A template example is provided below:

### *Criteria Chart*

Book Title and Author:		
Criteria	Rating	Student Notes
Overall Rating:		

Once all books have been explored, have children return to their charts and notes and examine each for their top contender. Allow them to assemble in small groups to discuss their choices and reasoning. Prior to children writing their evaluations, arguing the merits of their selection choice, librarians/teachers should model the writing process for them (using the model book and criteria chart used previously, in addition to the book evaluation graphic organizer).

Children's final written evaluation should contain an introduction (including a statement explaining their choice), a section containing reasons that support their choice (using criteria chart notes, and transition words), and a strong conclusion.

## ***Book Evaluation Graphic Organizer***

### **Introduction**

*--Include a statement about book choice for award*

### **Supporting Criteria**

(Encourage students to use transition words when explaining the reasons for their choices)

*--First...*

*--Next, Additionally, Second...*

*--Finally...*

### **Conclusion**

*--Include a strong opinion statement about how the criteria and reasoning (provided in the previous section) justifies the choice.*

## Argument Graphic Organizer

<b>Topic:</b>	
<b>Introduction:</b>	
<b>Claim:</b>	
<b>Body</b>	
<b>Support for Claim (detail from text)</b>	<b>1. Evidence from text</b>
	<b>2. Evidence from text</b>
	<b>3. Evidence from text</b>
<b>Conclusion:</b>	

**Further information and resources on creating text sets, conducting short research projects, designing text dependent questions, modeling close reading, and teaching vocabulary may be accessed at the Vermont Education Exchange <http://ve2.vermont.gov> in the Elementary Literacy Group.**